Minutes (Draft)
Bibliographic Standards Committee
Virtual ALA Annual Meeting
Zoom, Tuesday, June 22, 2021
1:00 - 3:00 pm EDT

Agenda (amended)
1. Welcome and announcements
2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on May 14, 2021 (Matković)
3. Reports on BSC activities
   a. RBMS-ARLIS/NA-SAA Joint Task Force on Development of the Art and Rare Materials BIBFRAME Ontology Extension (Kovari)
   b. Catalogers Directory (Adams)
   c. Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group (Bychowski/Reno)
   d. RBMS RDA Editorial Group (Hobart)
   e. OCLC Member Merge Working Group (Hildebrand)
4. Library of Congress Update (Théroux) [added agenda item]
5. Task Group on Addressing DEI in Bibliographic Standards and Bibliographic Description (Haugen/Isaac)
6. Closing announcements

Appendix A: BSC Minutes 2021-03-23
Appendix B: BSC Minutes 2021-05-14

Members present: Jennifer MacDonald, University of Delaware Library (co-chair); Honor Moody, Harvard Library (co-chair); Liz Adams, Duke University; Emily Baldoni, Georgetown University; Brenna Bychowski, Beinecke Library, Yale University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); kalan Knudson Davis, University of Minnesota Libraries; Alison Greenlee, Wayne State University; Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library (RBMS Web Team liaison); Ryan Hildebrand, University of Oregon; Elizabeth Hobart, Pennsylvania State University; Linda Isaac, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Deborah J. Leslie, Folger Shakespeare Library; Rafael A. Linares, La Casa del Libro Book Museum; Michelle Mascaro, University of California San Diego; Danijela Matković, Beinecke Library, Yale University (secretary); Philippe Mongeau, University of Delaware; Iris O’Brien, British Library; Lauren Reno, Duke University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); Jessie Sherwood, Robbins Collection, University of California Berkeley; Brian Stearns, University of Alberta; Amy Tims, American Antiquarian Society; Brittney Washington, Harry Ransom Center

Members absent: Katelyn Borbely, College for Creative Studies; Valerie Buck, Brigham Young University; Amy Brown, Boston College, Burns Library; Tammy Druash, University of North Florida; Matthew Ducmanas, Temple University
Liaison: Manon Théroux, Library of Congress (Library of Congress liaison)

Visitors: Sue Andrews, University of British Columbia; Erin Blake, Folger Shakespeare Library; Maren Cornett, University of Delaware; Patrick Crowley, Southern Connecticut State University; Diane Dias de Fazio; Zoe Dobbs, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Jennifer Dunlap, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Will Evans, Boston Athenaeum; Stephanie Fell, University of Nevada, Las Vegas; Pili Grace, San José State University; Matthew Haugen, Columbia University; Sarah Hoover, UNC-Chapel Hill; Yoonha Hwang, Yale Center for British Art; Bethany Kluender, University of Iowa; Jason Kovari, Cornell University; Francis Lapka, Yale Center for British Art; Kate Moriarty, Saint Louis University; Matthew Murphy, New York Public Library; Ann Myers, Stanford University; Maria Oldal, Morgan Library & Museum; Anchalee Panigabutra-Roberts, University of Tennessee Libraries; Jackie Parascandola, University of Pennsylvania; Paloma Graciano Picardo, Harry Ransom Center; Marja Rom, Southern Methodist University; Elizabeth Robinson, Library of Congress; Jonathan Tuttle, University of Richmond

1. Welcome and announcements

The co-chairs welcomed attendees and reviewed meeting norms. Emily Baldoni volunteered to monitor chat participation.

The co-chairs announced that the agenda had been amended to include a report by Manon Théroux, Library of Congress liaison, on Library of Congress activities.

2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on May 14, 2021 (Matković)

There were no questions regarding the May 14, 2021 minutes, which were passed via a Zoom poll.

3. Reports on BSC activities

a. RBMS-ARLIS/NA-SAA Joint Task Force on Development of the Art and Rare Materials BIBFRAME Ontology Extension (Kovari)

Jason Kovari, RBMS co-chair of the joint task force, submitted a final report and gave a presentation detailing the work completed by the group. The joint task force wrapped up modelling, created an OWL file, and submitted a final report to ACRL. The task force has a few outstanding tasks: finish implementation guidelines, revise skos vocabularies, and create an HTML file of ARM v.1.0.
Kovari anticipates handing off the completed ontology to BSC in July. He raised the issue of ongoing governance and shared the task force’s recommendation to form an independent editorial group with liaisons to BSC, SAA, and ARLIS/NA to manage the ontology in the future. It was agreed that BSC would follow up on this issue once SAA and ARLIS/NA had the opportunity to consider future governance options.

**b. Catalogers Directory (Adams)**

The editors of the BSC Rare Materials Catalogers Directory submitted a report and Liz Adams presented on recent developments. The directory was launched in January 2021 and received positive feedback. To this date there are 76 entries in the directory. The editors continue to work on improvements and have identified areas for redevelopment. For example, there were multiple requests by participants to edit their entries and the scoping for the subject expertise category is very broad and could be improved on.

In response to Adams’ questions relating to the promotion of the directory and the measuring of its impact, attendees made the following suggestions and comments: collaborate with the Program Planning Committee and promote the directory at conferences; use google analytics; repost regularly on email lists; collect skills less traditional: pymarc, GitHub, skos, DEI/cultural competencies; share a couple of successful examples of expert help.

**c. Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group (Bychowski/Reno)**

Brenna Bychowski, co-editor of the Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group (CVEG), provided a summary of the group’s recent activities. The beta version of the integrated thesaurus is now available on id.loc.gov: https://id.loc.gov/vocabulary/rbmstr.html

The entire thesaurus is available for searching and browsing but does not appear on the main landing page of id.loc.gov as it did not go live yet for cataloging. CVEG will be performing an initial review of the Beta thesaurus over the coming months, and welcomes BSC volunteers to join in that process. The expected time commitment for this initial review process is 2-3 hours per month over a period of a few months. A second review process will follow which will seek input from the broader special collections community.

**d. RBMS RDA Editorial Group (Hobart)**

Elizabeth Hobart, editor of the RBMS RDA Editorial Group, submitted a report and presented on the group’s recent activities relating to the preparation of Descriptive Cataloging of Rare Materials (RDA Edition) (DCRMR). The first iteration of DCRMR will be a minimal viable product with instructions for books only and the existing DCRM manuals will not be deprecated. The Editorial Group plans to publish a set of light-weight policy statements for the RDA Toolkit, which will link back to more detailed instructions in DCRMR.
Between February and April 2021, the group conducted a BSC review with some general findings: the feedback was overall positive, including comments related to the structure of the manual and the repetitions within it. Some usability issues were noted which improved when using the Chrome browser. Major changes from DCRM(B) will be compiled in a list and shared more broadly during the public review phase.

The editorial group flagged the following issues for future development: continue to reorganize chapter 1 (Title), add appendix to publication elements, address changes to existing DCRM(B) instructions, and clarify DCRM(B) instructions (e.g. citation style, library identifiers).

Hobart announced that the 040 code dcrmr has been approved by the Library of Congress. The code should not be used yet as DCRMR has not been finalized and published. Jessica Grzegorski will be serving as co-editor starting July 1, 2021. The editorial group began work on policy statements and integrating additional manuals (starting with graphics). The group has also begun initial discussions relating to the creation of Sinopia profiles.

Hobart concluded her presentation with a timeline. The group hopes to complete the BSC review phase with a BSC vote in September 2021. A public review phase will follow with the goal to share the new manual with the RBMS Executive Committee in early December 2021.

e. OCLC Member Merge Working Group (Hildebrand)

Ryan Hildebrand reported on the work of the Rare Materials Merge working group which includes the following members: Erin Blake, Randy Brandt, Ryan Hildebrand, Bob Maxwell, and Michelle Mascaro. The group is tasked with providing rare materials guidance for participants in OCLC’s Member Merge program which allows institutions to merge master records.

The working group has continued its revision of OCLC Member Merge documents to incorporate guidance on merging OCLC WorldCat records for various formats. To date the group has completed drafts for books, continuing resources, and scores, each of which BSC has voted to endorse. Merging duplicate books records: A field-by-field comparison has been published and drafts for continuing resources and scores have been sent to OCLC. Erin Blake completed a draft for merging duplicate graphic material records.

Responding to a question relating to the ongoing role of BSC in future developments, Hildebrand noted that OCLC would be interested in a continuous collaboration.
f. Library of Congress Update (Théroux)

Manon Théroux, Library of Congress liaison, provided the following updates:

Rare Materials Section Recon Project
The project is nearly halfway completed as circa 210,000 cards have been processed between August 2018 and May 2021. The rare book shelflist has been fully processed and the vendor is now working on special files projects. Most records have been distributed to OCLC.

ALA-LC Romanization Tables
There are new procedural guidelines that have been adopted for proposals of new and revised romanization tables. A new Romanization Table Review Board has been established and the Armenian table is currently under review.

LC Genre/Form Terms
The draft status of the LCGFT manual has been removed and the document is now official.

Program for Cooperative Cataloging
PCC charged a number of new groups:

- PCC Task Group on Developing Guidelines for BIBFRAME and MARC Bibliographic Encoding for Languages (charge). The task group is coordinating a test in which ISO 639-3 language codes will be added to authority and bibliographic records, in addition to the standard MARC language codes. The test is expected to run for 4 months between June and September 2021.
- PCC Advisory Committee on Diversity, Ethics, and Inclusion (charge).
- PCC Metadata Application Profiles Working Group will oversee the creation and maintenance of PCC Metadata Application Profiles that will support both MARC 21 and linked data workflows.

A meeting of the PCC Operations Committee took place in May 2021. The agenda includes links to presentations and recordings.

BIBFRAME
LC BIBFRAME pilot participants began working in a newly-redesigned editor in early June. The current goal is to have all catalogers working in BIBFRAME by the end of 2021.

Official RDA Toolkit
LC-PCC has not yet determined when to implement the Official RDA Toolkit. The implementation will take place no earlier than July 2022. LC-PCC Policy Statements have been published and should not be used yet. A form is available to report errors. The Metadata Guidance Documents which are intended to be used in conjunction with the policy statements are in development. Anticipated completion date for the guidance documents is late October 2021.
Descriptive Cataloging Manual Z1:
Changes:
008/32: added additional instructions for undifferentiated records discovered to represent only one identity
024 field: removed moratorium and added link to best practices
Appendix 1 (Ambiguous Entities): added instructions to use 151 tag in records for Canadian First Nations
370 field: added guidance on changes of name and on use of subfield $c

Forthcoming changes (August 2021): best practice guidelines for 385 and 386 fields

Conventional Collective Titles
A new policy eliminates the use of conventional collective titles for partial compilations of literary and artistic works created after 1500 by a single agent.

The Task Group on Addressing DEI in Bibliographic Standards and Bibliographic Description (Haugen/Isaac)

The Task Group on Addressing Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in Bibliographic Standards and in Bibliographic Description submitted a final report and Matthew Haugen, co-chair of the task group, reported on the group’s activities.

The initial work of the Task Group on Addressing DEI in Bibliographic Standards and Bibliographic Description consisted of conducting a review and evaluation of existing institutional statements on harmful language and bias in metadata descriptions. In addition, the group identified groups and institutions which are pursuing similar efforts and determined a series of issues specific to the special collections community.

Haugen proceeded to summarize the recommendations of the task group:

- The BSC should serve as an advocate and guide for the creation of institutional statements on the presence of harmful metadata in resource descriptions
- Develop best practices for transcriptions that contain harmful language, recognize bias in controlled vocabularies and highlight contributions from marginalized communities
- Prepare and educate copy catalogers
- Advocate for the creation of long-term and permanent positions
- Consult and work with stakeholder communities affected by the problematic metadata
- Develop related programs for conferences and a DEI toolkit

Linda Isaac added that some type of clearinghouse was needed to coordinate the various DEI efforts. A brief discussion followed on what next steps to take.

Action item: Form a Steering Committee which will coordinate DEI projects and charge other groups to work on various DEI efforts.
4. Closing announcements

The co-chairs thanked outgoing members for their service and welcomed new members.

Philippe Mongeau, co-chair of the Program Planning Group, put out a call for ideas and topics for the next RBMS conference in 2022 in New Haven, CT.

The meeting closed at 2:53 p.m.

Respectfully submitted July 30, 2021 by Danijela Matković, RBMS Bibliographic Standards Committee secretary.
Appendix A: BSC Minutes 2021-03-23

Minutes
Bibliographic Standards Committee
Virtual Meeting
Zoom, Tuesday, March 23, 2021
1:30 - 3:00 pm EDT

Agenda
1. Welcome and announcements
2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual ALA meeting on January 29, 2021 (Matković)
3. Reports on BSC activities
   a. CC:DA (Stearns)
   b. MAC (Washington)
   c. Standard Citation Forms (Sherwood)
4. Closing announcements

Members present: Jennifer MacDonald, University of Delaware Library (co-chair); Honor Moody, Harvard Library (co-chair); Liz Adams, Duke University; Emily Baldoni, Georgetown University; Katelyn Borbely, College for Creative Studies; Amy Brown, Boston College, Burns Library; Valerie Buck, Brigham Young University; Brenna Bychowski, Beinecke Library, Yale University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); kalan Knudson Davis, University of Minnesota Libraries; Tammy Druash, University of North Florida; Matthew Ducmanas, Temple University; Alison Greenlee, Wayne State University; Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library (RBMS Web Team liaison); Ryan Hildebrand, University of Oregon; Elizabeth Hobart, Pennsylvania State University; Linda Isaac, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Deborah J. Leslie, Folger Shakespeare Library; Rafael Linares; Michelle Mascaro, University of California San Diego; Danijela Matković, Beinecke Library, Yale University (secretary); Philippe Mongeau, University of Delaware; Iris O’Brien, British Library; Lauren Reno, Duke University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); Jessie Sherwood, Robbins Collection, University of California Berkeley; Brian Stearns, University of Alberta; Amy Tims, American Antiquarian Society; Brittney Washington, Harry Ransom Center

Members absent:

Visitors: Phoenix Alexander, Sydney Jones Library, University of Liverpool; Erin Blake, Folger Shakespeare Library; Abigail Connick, Smith College; Ellen Cordes, Lewis Walpole Library, Yale University; Bonnie Dede, University of Michigan Library; Zoe Dobbs, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Laura Doublet, University of Victoria; Jennifer Dunlap, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Emily Epstein, University of Colorado, Strauss Health Sciences Library; Stephanie
1. Welcome and announcements

The co-chairs welcomed attendees and reviewed meeting norms. Amy Brown volunteered to monitor chat participation.

2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on January 29, 2021 (Matković)

The draft minutes were approved via a Zoom poll during the meeting.

3. Reports on BSC activities

   a. CC:DA (Stearns)

Brian Stearns, BSC liaison to the ALA Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access (CC:DA), reported on topics discussed at CC:DA’s ALA Midwinter meetings. James Hennelly gave a presentation on the new RDA toolkit which will not be adopted by LC/PCC before mid-2022. It was announced that all LC catalogers are expected to work in BIBFRAME by the end of the fiscal year. LC’s pilot to stop using conventional collective titles for selections of poetry by one author was successful. PCC started to conduct a feasibility study for other literary forms. A significant amount of meeting time was spent on discussions relating to the format of future meetings. A Virtual Participation Task Force is working on recommendations for virtual meetings and committee work in ALA Connect.

Stearns fielded questions among others relating to the LC pilot program and noted that Core: Leadership, Infrastructure, Futures does not have an official position on the new RDA toolkit. It was also noted that the ARLIS/NA Cataloging Advisory Committee was approached to resubmit a request not to add conventional collective titles to publications that reproduce artworks demonstrating a broader move away from conventional collective titles.
b. MAC (Washington)

Brittney Washington, BSC liaison to the MARC Advisory Committee (MAC), reported on two topics discussed at the MAC meetings in January. Participants considered a proposal on using RDA’s controlled list of values for 'type of binding' and coding this data in subfield 1 of the 340 MARC field. The proposal was withdrawn as it did not allow the use of non-RDA vocabularies.

MAC also discussed a working paper on possible options to include a wider range of provenance data such as introducing additional subfields or using the 883 field. It was decided that more guidance was needed to compose a proposal.

Following a brief discussion on how to shape the fairly new liaison role, the co-chairs proposed a subcommittee which would take a group approach to reviewing MAC proposals and working papers.

c. Standard Citation Forms (Sherwood)

The Standard Citation Forms Editorial Team submitted a report and Jessie Sherwood presented on the activities of the group. The editorial team continued to update and publish new citation forms. The linked data project has been put on hold and the editorial team has continued to add URI’s to citation forms where available.

4. Closing announcements

Moody announced that a test instance of ESTC as linked data (ESTC21) is available for experimentation: https://estc21.dh.tamu.edu. The site is hosted by Texas A&M.

The co-chairs shared a document which details the charge and membership of the RBMS BSC Task Group on Addressing Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion in Bibliographic Standards and in Bibliographic Description.

The meeting closed at 2:26 p.m.

Respectfully submitted May 3, 2021 by Danijela Matković, RBMS Bibliographic Standards Committee secretary.
Appendix A: BSC Minutes 2021-05-14

Minutes
Bibliographic Standards Committee
Virtual Meeting
Zoom, Friday, May 14, 2021
3:30 - 4:30 pm EDT

Agenda
1. Welcome and announcements
2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on March 23, 2021 (Matković)
3. Reports on BSC activities
   a. MARC/RDA Working Group (Davis)
   b. Program Planning Group (Hobart/Mongeau)
4. Closing announcements

Members present: Jennifer MacDonald, University of Delaware Library (co-chair); Honor Moody, Harvard Library (co-chair); Liz Adams, Duke University; Emily Baldoni, Georgetown University; Katelyn Borbely, College for Creative Studies; Valerie Buck, Brigham Young University; Brenna Bychowski, Beinecke Library, Yale University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); kalan Knudson Davis, University of Minnesota Libraries; Matthew Ducmanas, Temple University; Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library (RBMS Web Team liaison); Ryan Hildebrand, University of Oregon; Elizabeth Hobart, Pennsylvania State University; Linda Isaac, Houghton Library, Harvard University; Deborah J. Leslie, Folger Shakespeare Library; Rafael A. Linares, La Casa del Libro Museum; Michelle Mascaro, University of California San Diego; Danijela Matković, Beinecke Library, Yale University (secretary); Philippe Mongeau, University of Delaware; Jessie Sherwood, Robbins Collection, University of California Berkeley; Amy Tims, American Antiquarian Society; Brittney Washington, Harry Ransom Center

Members absent: Amy Brown, Boston College, Burns Library; Tammy Druash, University of North Florida; Alison Greenlee, Wayne State University; Iris O’Brien, British Library; Lauren Reno, Duke University (ex officio: Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group co-editor); Brian Stearns, University of Alberta

Liaison: Manon Théroux, Library of Congress (Library of Congress liaison)

Visitors: Erin Blake, Folger Shakespeare Library; Ellen Cordes, Lewis Walpole Library, Yale University; Maren Cornett, University of Delaware; Zoe Dobbs, Beinecke Library, Yale University; Laura Doublet, University of Victoria; Emily Epstein, University of Colorado, Strauss Health Sciences Library; Will Evans, Boston Athenaeum; Stephanie Fell, University of Nevada,
1. Welcome and announcements

The co-chairs welcomed attendees and reviewed meeting norms. Emily Baldoni volunteered to monitor chat participation.

The co-chairs reminded attendees of ALA’s recent shift from Sympa discussion lists to ALA Connect.

2. Review of draft minutes from the BSC virtual meeting on March 23, 2021 (Matković)

The draft minutes were approved via a Zoom poll during the meeting.

3. Reports on BSC activities

   a. MARC/RDA Working Group (Davis)

kalan Knudson Davis submitted a report and presented on the work of the MARC/RDA Working Group. She briefly reviewed the charge of the working group and emphasized the group’s goal to “ensure effective data exchange into the future”.

The working group has prepared three discussion papers and one proposal for the upcoming Marc Advisory Committee (MAC) meeting at ALA Annual in July.

Discussion papers:
- Data provenance
- Non-cartographic scale content
- Representative expressions

Proposal:
- Type of binding

The discussion paper on data provenance has been further refined taking into account discussions that took place at the 2021 MAC Midwinter meeting in January of this year. The new
proposal on type of binding has been broadened to allow for the inclusion of terms from various controlled vocabularies such as AAT and RBMS binding terms in MARC 340 subfield l.

b. Program Planning Group (Hobart/Mongeau)

Philippe Mongeau summarized the Program Planning Group report. The 2021 RBMS conference will be held virtually. Presentations that were originally accepted for the 2020 RBMS conference will take place this year and include: “My Favorite Mistake,” “Mitigating Pejorative Terminology in Descriptive Standards,” and “LD4P2 and Rare Materials.” Workshops that were accepted last year will not take place during the 2021 conference due to the complexities of a virtual conference platform.

The Program Planning Group has been tasked with exploring the possibility of offering webinars on topics related to rare materials cataloging. Following a call for presentation ideas to the DCRM list in February, the group has been developing several topics, including webinars highlighting interesting items we’ve cataloged, tools to facilitate cataloging, and a workshop on cataloging objects/realia.

The group has issued a call for proposals for lightning talks on interesting items and plans to offer this webinar in late-summer or early-fall 2021.

4. Closing announcements

The co-chairs announced that they will send out a survey allowing members to volunteer for the various tasks and sub-groups within the committee.

Manon Théroux, Library of Congress liaison, announced PCC’s new policy on compilations of works by one agent and submitted a report after the meeting. The new policy eliminates the use of conventional collective titles for partial compilations of literary and artistic works, provided the works are by a single agent and were created after 1500.

Brenna Bychowski, co-editor of the Controlled Vocabularies Editorial Group, announced the group’s plans to unveil the beta version of the integrated thesaurus on id.loc.gov at ALA Annual. The editorial group is looking for BSC members who are interested in participating in the first review phase. The group will conduct a second review process seeking input from the broader rare materials community.

The meeting closed at 4:02 p.m.

Respectfully submitted June 1, 2021 by Danijela Matković, RBMS Bibliographic Standards Committee secretary.